Sometime	l Records Center
81. B: W	elis Ga H
BREAK:	11.9
OTHER:	464454

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

ANNE ANDERSON, et al.

VS

CRYOVAC, Division of W. R. Grace & Co.; W. R. GRACE & CO.; JOHN J. RILEY COMPANY, Division of Beatrice Foods Co; BEATRICE FOODS CO.

Civil Action No. 82-1672-S

Deposition of EDWARD ORAZINE, taken on behalf of the Plaintiffs, pursuant to the applicable provisions of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, before Valerie T. Wong, Notary Public within and for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, at the offices of Foley, Hoag & Eliot, One Post Office Square, Boston, Massachusetts, commencing at 10:50 o'clock A.M. on Friday, July 26, 1985.

Appearances:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Jan Richard Schlichtmann, Esq. Kevin P. Conway, Esq. 171 Milk Street Boston, Massachusetts for the Plaintiffs.

William J. Cheeseman, Esq. Foley, Hoag & Eliot One Post Office Square Boston, Massachusetts for the Defendant W. R. Grace & Co.

Susan G. Winkler, Esq. Hale & Dorr 60 State Street Boston, Massachusetts for the Defendant Beatrice Foods Co.

Kevin J. O'Dea, Esq. 20 Ashburton Place Boston, Massachusetts for the Deponent.

INDEX

Deposition of:	Direct	Cross
Dharat Ourster		
Edward Orazine	t	***

LAWYER'S NOTES

Page	Line	
	· 	
	· · · · · ·	
	_	

LAWYER'S NOTES

Page	Line	

MR. CHEESEMAN: This deposition, at

Mr. O'Dea's request, is being taken pursuant to a

modified Rule 31 procedure, that is a deposition of

written interrogatories although counsel are present
in the room.

We have asked, and Mr. Schlichtmann agreed, that he provide the questions to us in advance in written form, which he has done. We have reviewed them, or rather Mr. O'Dea has reviewed them with the witness, and this morning we have agreed to modify the questions slightly. With those modifications, the Defendant W. R. Grace withdraws its objection to the form which was submitted to Mr. Schlichtmann a day or two ago.

We have also agreed that when the questions have all been read and the answers taken down by the stenographer, that we will take a break and Mr. Schlichtmann can prepare any follow-up questions he would like to ask, and then we will reconvene after a little while and go through those additional questions. You can certainly follow the same procedure if there should be any cross examination.

Objections and motions to strike, other

25

easier.

2	than with respect to matters of form, are reserved,
3	and the deposition transcript may be signed by the
4	witness under the pains and penalties of perjury
5	rather than before a notary public.
6	MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Right.
7	MR. CHEESEMAN: And the filing of the
8	transcript will be waived.
9	MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Okay.
10	MR. CHEESEMAN: Is that agreeable?
11	MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Very agreeable.
12	MR. CHEESEMAN: I just want to state
13	this modified Rule 31 procedure had been agreed to
14	by stipulation of parties at the request of
15	Mr. O'Dea, the witness's attorney, because the
16	witness has had a long-standing hypertensive
17	condition and is concerned about stress that a
18	deposition may cause.
19	(Discussion off the record)
20	MR. CHEESEMAN: Because we have made
21	some changes to the questions, I will sit by the
22	stenographer.
23	MR. SCHLICHTMANN: I think it will be
	11

MR. CHEESEMAN: And I'll help her with

the questions.

If you don't understand any of these questions that are read to you, just say so and we will figure out how to clarify it so you do understand. If you need to take a break at any point during the session to stretch your legs or any other reason, I am sure Mr. Schlichtmann and I will have no objection to taking a break. And feel free to speak to Mr. O'Dea from time to time.

MR. SCHLICHTMANN: That is perfectly all right.

EDWARD ORAZINE,

a witness called by the Plaintiffs, first having been duly sworn, on oath deposes and says as follows:

Direct Examination

- Q (By the reporter) Please state your name, address and present association with W. R. Grace.
- A Edward Orazine, 7 Chetwynd Road, Cambridge, Mass.

 I have no present association; I am retired. I
 had worked part-time up until May and I have taken

the summer months off.

Q Please describe the years you worked for W. R. Grace and describe your various positions and duties during that period.

A From 1955 to 1984.

I was hired as an electrician and done electrical work. I done some mechanical work, assembly work. I was a group electrical leader, group leader of the electrical department. At that time I built control panels, repaired machines, wired machines. I have done service work throughout the country and Canada for the repairing and setting up of our equipment.

I was a leadman assembly. My job as leadman assembly still had the electrical department ment and I was running the mechanical department under my foreman. In 1979, I was made foreman of the assembly department, still worked in the -- I still worked, done the electrical work, designing control circuits and panels. I picked one of my top mechanics out and had him run the mechanical part for me under my supervision so I would have more time to spend with the electrical control wiring that I was still performing even though I

1

8 2 was foreman. 3 MR. CHEESEMAN: If that is the complete 4 answer, can we stop for a minute? 5 (Discussion off the record) 6 Do you have any knowledge concerning, or are you Q 7 aware, whether or not waste chemicals or waste 8 liquid were ever disposed of on W. R. Grace's 9 property in Woburn by disposal of the material 10 down drains? 11 A I'm not aware of any chemicals going down into the 12 drains. 13 Q Do you have any knowledge concerning, or are you 14 aware, whether or not waste chemicals or waste 15 liquid were ever disposed of on W. R. Grace's 16 property in Woburn by disposal of the material 17 on the ground? 18 I can recall at times seeing some outside the 19 warehouse door, signs of oil. It seemed at times 20 they may be people changing the oil in their car 21 and may have spilled some. 22 MR. CHEESEMAN: If I can interrupt at 23 this point. 24 Are you aware of any other instances

where chemicals or waste liquid may have been

disposed of on W. R. Grace's property in Woburn by disposal of the material on the ground apart from the automobile oil that you just mentioned?

THE WITNESS: Oh, yes. I became aware at one time, and I don't recall exactly when, the whole plant was called into the cafeteria --

MR. O'DEA: The issue was --

MR. CHEESEMAN: This is still on the ground rather than excavation. Were there any other instances of on the ground apart from the automobile oil?

THE WITNESS: No, sir.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Okay.

THE WITNESS: I recall there was a plant meeting, and I don't recall exactly the date, but I know that the whole plant was called into the cafeteria and it was explained -- we were told that the EPA was told that Cryovac had some drums in the yard and they were going to dig up.

I then recall at one time standing by
the shipping room door after the digging was going
on, seeing what appeared to be a drum or a piece
of a drum hanging in the air.

MR. CHEESEMAN: If you don't mind my

doing it this way: Apart from your having observed the drum being removed from the ground you just described, do you have any knowledge, or are you aware, of any other instances where waste chemicals or waste liquid were ever disposed of on W. R. Grace's property in Woburn by disposal of the material in any excavated areas, either in drums or liquid form?

THE WITNESS: I have no knowledge of that.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Off the record.

(Discussion off the record)

MR. CHEESEMAN: We just discussed off the record whether subparts A, B, C, D and E of Question 3 submitted by Mr. Schlichtmann should be read, and it has been agreed for the moment, in view of the answer, they need not be read but the plaintiffs, of course, will consider whether to ask questions like that when we resume after the break.

We will now go on to Question 4.

(Discussion off the record)

MR. CHEESEMAN: If I may just explain the procedure, Mr. Orazine. Question No. 4 that

has been submitted by Mr. Schlichtmann's office is asking whether you had any conversations with anyone relating to the event that you described previously of watching some material being excavated from the hole in the back.

THE WITNESS: I think at the time of the meeting I overheard, as we were coming out of the meeting or sometime after that, I overheard a conversation that mentioned Frank Kelly's name as knowing something about the drums. I don't recall who it was that was speaking.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Let me suggest that the stenographer ask the three follow-up questions to Question 4.

(Discussion off the record)

- Please describe the full extent of the conversation. Please indicate as best you remember what you said and what the other parties said from the beginning of the conversation until the end.
- A I have very little memory of it. All I can remember is that Frank Kelly's name came up; someone mentioned Frank Kelly's name and mentioned the word "drums."

MR. CHEESEMAN: Is that all you

1 2 remember of the conversation? 3 THE WITNESS: That is about all I can 4 remember. 5 Please describe the persons involved. 6 I don't know who the person was that was speaking. 7 I wasn't facing the person; I was walking away. 8 just happened to overhear something. 9 Please describe the date and place of the 10 conversation. 11 I can't remember the date. I think it was on the 12 way out of the cafeteria after the meeting that I 13 had specified. 14 MR. O'DEA: That is the meeting you 15 described in response to Question 3 of the 16 excavated area? 17 THE WITNESS: Yeah. 18 Q Did you at any time instruct, authorize, request 19 or otherwise order any individuals to dispose of 20 waste material or waste liquid down any drains of 21 the W. R. Grace property in Woburn? 22 I do not ever remember doing this. A 23 Did you at any time instruct, authorize, request 24 or otherwise order any individuals to dispose of 25 waste material or waste liquid on the ground of

1		13
2		the W. R. Grace property in Woburn?
3	A	I have no memory of ever doing that.
4	Q	Did you at any time instruct, authorize, request
5		or otherwise order any individuals to dispose of
6		waste material or waste liquid in any excavated
7		areas of the W. R. Grace property in Woburn?
8	A	I have no memory of ever doing that.
9		MR. CHEESEMAN: Mr. Schlichtmann was out
10		of the room for a telephone call briefly. He is
11		now back in the room.
12		Jan, in view of the negative answers to
13		Question 5, are we agreed we should skip the sub-
14		parts?
15		MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yeah.
16		MR. CHEESEMAN: Okay.
17	Q	Did anyone at any time request, authorize, instruct
18		or order you to dispose of waste material or waste
19		liquid on the W. R. Grace property down drains?
20	A	I have no memory of anyone ever asking me to do so.
21	Q	Did anyone at any time request, authorize, instruct
22		or order you to dispose of waste material or waste
23		liquid on the W. R. Grace property on the ground?
24	A	No one ever told me to do that.
25	Ω	Did anyone at any time request, authorize, instruct

or order you to dispose of waste material or waste liquid on the W. R. Grace property in excavated areas?

- A No one ever told me to do anything like that.
- Q Did anyone at any time request, authorize, instruct or order you to request, authorize, instruct or order any other individuals to dispose of waste material or waste liquid on the W. R. Grace property down drains?
- A I have no memory of anyone ever doing so; no.

MR. CHEESEMAN: If I may, Jan.

Mr. Orazine, I want to be sure you understand that
this last question is now asking whether anyone
ever told you to have someone other than yourself
do that. Did you understand that?

THE WITNESS: Yes, sir. No one ever told me to have someone do it.

MR. CHEESEMAN: And the next two questions are similar.

Did anyone at any time request, authorize, instruct or order you to request, authorize, instruct or order any other individuals to dispose of waste material or waste liquid on the W. R. Grace property on the ground?

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1		15
2	A	No one ever asked me to do that.
3	Q	Did anyone at any time request, authorize, instruct
4		or order you to request, authorize, instruct or
5	1	order any other individuals to dispose of waste
6		material or waste liquid on the W. R. Grace
7		property in excavated areas?
8	A	No one ever, to my memory, told me to do anything
9		like that.
10		MR. CHEESEMAN: Since those answers to
11		the group of questions under Question 6 were all
12		negative, are we agreed the subparts should be
13		skipped?
14		MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes.
	[]	

To your knowledge, was Mr. Vincent Forte aware or have any knowledge of, participate in or indicate to you that he had any awareness, knowledge or participation in any of the events described in

answers to Questions 3, 4 5 and 6 above?

MR. CHEESEMAN: Jan, if I may interject to assist the witness in understanding the next question.

This is now asking you whether you have any reason to believe or know that Mr. Forte was aware of any of the events you have described so

far this morning, including the automobile engine
oil you have referred to and the removal of a drum
or drums from a hole in the back.

A He was not aware of the automobile stuff. The only
way I remember -- I think Vinnie is the individual
that gave the speech in the cafeteria when he told
us the EPA would be there, was coming.

MR. CHEESEMAN: If I might, Jan. The question is also intended to ask you whether so far as you're aware you have any reason to think Mr. Forte had known about the drums being buried in the hole in the first place.

THE WITNESS: I have no way of knowing that.

MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Whether Mr. Forte had any knowledge about waste disposal on the property in drains, on the ground or in excavated areas.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Why don't you set that up as an additional question? It's a little different from these.

As to the subparts to Question 7, Jan, did the answer eliminate, in your judgment, a need to carry them through or do you want to -- I guess

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

it eliminates A and B.

MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes.

(Discussion off the record)

MR. CHEESEMAN: Mr. Orazine, the next several questions are seeking the same kind of information about certain other named individuals. Each of the questions is asking if you have any reason to think or if you have any awareness whether the person named in each of the questions had any knowledge himself of the activities that you have already described, such as the automobile oil and the barrel or barrels removed from the pit in back. Just listen to the questions the stenographer will now be asking you.

- To your knowledge, was Mr. Paul Shalline aware or Q have any knowledge of, participate in or indicate to you that he had any awareness, knowledge or participation in any of the events described in answers to Questions 3, 4, 5 and 6 above?
- A No, he didn't.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Jan, shall we skip A and **B?**

> MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes.

To your knowledge, was Mr. Frank Kelly aware or Q

2 have any knowledge of, participate in or indicate 3 to you that he had any awareness, knowledge or 4 participation in any of the events described in 5 answers to Questions 3, 4, 5 and 6 above? 6 A No; other than the conversation that I had, you 7 know, described to you that I had overheard. 8 MR. CHEESEMAN: Jan, does that answer A 9 and B for you? 10 MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yeah. 11 0 To your knowledge, was Mr. Thomas Barbas aware or 12 have any knowledge of, participate in or indicate 13 to you that he had any awareness, knowledge or 14 participation in any of the events described in 15 answers to Questions 3, 4, 5 and 6 above? 16 A No. 17 MR. CHEESEMAN: Does that take care of 18 A and B? 19 MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes. 20 Q To your knowledge, was Mr. Richard Stewart aware 21 or have any knowledge of, participate in or 22 indicate to you that he had any awareness, 23 knowledge or participation in any of the events 24 described in answers to Questions 3, 4, 5 and 6

25

above?

•		19
2	A	I have no way of knowing. I never met Mr. Stewart
3		or spoke to Mr. Stewart.
4		MR. CHEESEMAN: Does that take care of
5		A and B?
6	:	MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes.
7		MR. CHEESEMAN: Number 12 is different.
8	Q	Did you at any time have any conversation with any-
9		one or indicate to anyone that "nothing will ever
10		grow here" or words to that effect in reference to
11		the area near or between the warehouse and the main
12		building?
13	A	I can't ever remember having any conversation like
14		that with anyone.
15		MR. CHEESEMAN: Jan, does that take care
16		of the subparts?
17		MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes.
18		MR. CHEESEMAN: That is all the questions
19		here. Shall we adjourn to another room and discuss
20		any follow-up questions?
21		MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Yes.
22		(Recess)
23		MR. CHEESEMAN: We have taken a break
24		and Mr. Schlichtmann and Mr. Conway have prepared
25		some additional questions for the stenographer to

read to the witness.

The first questions will relate to some aerial photographs which have been marked as exhibits in previous depositions in this case. And the first question will relate to Barbas Exhibit 4, which is an aerial photograph dated March 26, 1966 on the back.

- Q Do you have any knowledge that any waste liquid or waste solvents were disposed of by any person where there are markings on the photograph?
- A I have no knowledge of any waste materials being put in those areas.

MR. CHEESEMAN: The next photograph is Barbas Exhibit 5, which contains a date of April 11, 1975.

- Q Do you have any knowledge that any waste liquid or waste solvents were disposed of by any person where there are markings on the photograph?
- A I have no memory of any material being put there.

In this photograph where I mentioned oil, I would put it right by the shipping room door here (Indication) where I have seen spots and stuff.

MR. O'DEA: Is that adjacent to the

	21
2	letter D?
3	THE WITNESS: Right in this area
4	(Indication).
5	MR. CHEESEMAN: Right by the letter D.
6	THE WITNESS: A little closer to the
7	door by that general area.
8	MR. CHEESEMAN: Okay.
9	THE WITNESS: That is where I have seen
10	oil, oil slicks, spots.
11	MR. CHEESEMAN: What about Ml and PS?
12	THE WITNESS: No, sir. I don't
13	remember anything in Ml or PS. All I can remember
14	is the pit area that the EPA dug up.
15	MR. O'DEA: Okay.
16	MR. CHEESEMAN: And I think the question
17	also referred to the outlined area across the whole
18	back of the building that is marked D.
19	THE WITNESS: I don't recall any
20	chemicals ever being disposed of there in that
21	area.
22	MR. CHEESEMAN: I think those are the
23	markings.
24	(Discussion off the record)
25	MR. CHEESEMAN: The next photograph is

'		22
2		marked Barbas Exhibit 2, and it indicates on the
3		back a date of March 15, 1974.
4	Q	Do you have any knowledge that any waste liquid or
5		waste solvents were disposed of by any person
6		where there are markings on the photograph?
7		MR. CHEESEMAN: PS.
8	A	I have no recollection of any material being dumped
9		there.
10		MR. CHEESEMAN: M1?
11		THE WITNESS: Or Ml.
12		The part that says pit, I have no
13		recollection of a pit being there.
14		MR. O'DEA: What about this one
15		(Indication), a line with two arrows on it?
16	;	THE WITNESS: I don't recall any kind of
17		a ditch there or anything.
18		MR. O'DEA: The question Ms. Wong asked
19		was whether anything was disposed of, any waste
20		liquid or waste solvents.
21		THE WITNESS: I have no recollection of
22		anything being disposed of there.
23		MR. O'DEA: Perhaps we can use the
24		latest photograph as a reference for the next
25		question?

2		MR. CHEESEMAN: The witness, in answer-
3		ing the next series of questions, will have before
4		him Barbas Exhibit 5, which is an aerial photograph
5		marked as having been taken April 11, 1975.
6	Q	Do you have any knowledge that the drainage trench
7		which ran along the warehouse and is now covered
8		by peastone and asphalt was used by any person or
9		persons to dispose of any waste solvents or liquids
10		at any time?
11	A	I have no knowledge of any waste material being put
12		there.
13	Q	Do you have any knowledge that the drainage trench
14		along the north boundary of the property was used
15		by any person or persons to dispose of any waste
16		solvents or liquids at any time?
17	A	I have no knowledge of waste material being put
18		there.
19	Q	Do you have any knowledge that manholes on the
20		property were used by any person or persons to
21		dispose of any waste solvents or liquids at any
22		time?
23		MR. CHEESEMAN: With Jan's permission,

I will elucidate the last question.

I think he wants you to answer that

24

without reference to the photograph, just any manholes you're aware of.

A I'm not aware of any material being put in any manholes.

MR. CHEESEMAN: If I can just elaborate upon the question. Do you know that there was a manhole cover on the pavement near the rear of the main building along the center of that wall just outside the chain-link fence?

THE WITNESS: I think I'm aware there is a manhole, that there is a cover.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Specifically, that question included whether you have any knowledge that that manhole at the back of the main building was ever used by any person or persons to dispose of any waste solvents or liquids at any time.

THE WITNESS: To my knowledge, I have never seen it used for disposing of any chemicals or materials in it.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Or did you ever hear anyone suggest it was used for that purpose?

THE WITNESS: And I never heard anyone saying it was.

MR. SCHLICHTMANN: How about the

(Discussion off the record)

MR. CHEESEMAN: I think Mr. Schlichtmann means to ask the same question with respect to the previous locations of that manhole before the second addition was built. It was under that area before the first addition was built and under that area (Indication).

THE WITNESS: I don't recall it at that time.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Do you recall seeing or hearing anyone say that material was disposed of in those manholes?

THE WITNESS: Never heard of anyone saying they had disposed of any chemical or material in the manholes.

MR. SCHLICHTMANN: Okay.

- Q Do you have any knowledge that storm drains in the property were used by any person or persons to dispose of any waste solvents or liquids at any time?
- I have no knowledge of anyone ever using the storm drains for disposing of chemicals or materials in them.

1		26
2	Q	Do you intend to return as an employee to W. R.
3		Grace?
4	A	Well, I have got to see my doctor first to see what
5		he says. I hope that I am okay to go back part-
6		time because but I have to see him first. I
7		don't know what he will tell me to do.
8		MR. CHEESEMAN: I think the intent was
9		to ask you if your doctor says it is all right for
10		you to resume work, do you intend to resume part-
11		time for Grace?
12		THE WITNESS: I wouldn't mind. I
13		probably would.
14		MR. CHEESEMAN: Okay.
15		(Discussion off the record)
16		(Recess)
17		MR. CHEESEMAN: Mr. Schlichtmann has
18		just produced another question.
19	Ω	Do you have any knowledge how waste solvents or
20		waste material were disposed of on the W. R.
21		Grace property by any person at any time other
22		than what you have already described?
23	A	I have no knowledge of how they disposed of their
24		waste material.
25		MR. SCHLICHTMANN: We have no further

questions.

MR. CHEESEMAN: Susan?

MS. WINKLER: No questions.

(Whereupon the deposition was adjourned at 11:40.)

JURAT

I, EDWARD ORAZINE, have read
the foregoing transcript of
testimony and the same
contains a true and accurate
recording of my answers given
to the questions therein set
forth.

penalties o	f perjury	this	
day	of	<u> </u>	
1985.			

Signed under the pains and

EDWARD ORAZINE

JURAT

I, EDWARD ORAZINE, have read
the foregoing transcript of
testimony and the same
contains a true and accurate
recording of my answers given
to the questions therein set
forth.

enalties of perjury this
day of
985.

Signed under the pains and

EDWARD ORAZINE

CERTIFICATE

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS)

One of the control of the control

I, Valerie T. Wong, Notary Public within and for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, do hereby certify:

That EDWARD ORAZINE, the witness whose deposition is hereinbefore set forth, was duly sworn by me and that such deposition is a true record of the testimony given.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my seal of office this 5th day of ________, 1985.

NOTARY PUBLIC

My Commission Expires: November 5, 1987.